Row-Level Security sucks. Can we make it usable? **FOSDEM 2025**

Jimmy Angelakos

About me

- Systems & Database Architect
- Based in Edinburgh, Scotland
- Open Source user & contributor (25+ years)
- PostgreSQL exclusively (16+ years)
- Author, PostgreSQL Mistakes and How to Avoid Them
- Co-author, PostgreSQL 16 Administration Cookbook
- **pg_statviz** PostgreSQL extension

Contents

- What is RLS?
- When to use it
- How it works
- How to use it

- What's wrong with it
- What to do about it
- More things to try

Motivation, etc.

- Customer wanted application users to not see each other's data
- Duh? But:
- Customer was used to application being badly coded
- REST URLs like /user/1234/data

What is Row-Level Security (RLS)?

- Fine-grained control over which rows are visible to which users
- Provides additional security beyond table or column level privileges

- It's a type of Access Control List (ACL)
- Saves you applicationside security filtering

When would you use RLS?

- Confidential data
 - Restrict access to sensitive records
- Role / department separation
 - e.g. only HR sees HRrelated content

- Multi-tenant systems
 - Separate data for each customer/tenant in the same DB
- Finer-grained visibility control (row vs table)

How does RLS work?

- From user perspective, rows they're not allowed to see "don't exist"
- Key concepts:
 - Policy
 - Conditions for reading/modifying rows
 - Security barrier
 - Query optimizer doesn't inline/restructure query to bypass RLS

How does RLS work?

- It's exactly an ACL
- Internally, you are effectively adding WHERE conditions to the query

• Permissive / Restrictive policies

- Permissive: policy_A OR policy_B (default)
- Restrictive: policy_C AND policy_D

How does RLS work?

- pg_catalog.pg_policy
 - polrelid: The table to which the policy applies
 - polcmd: The command for which the policy is: SELECT, INSERT, UPDATE, DELETE, all
 - polpermissive: Policy permissive (true) or restrictive
 - polroles: Array of roles that the policy applies to
 - polqual: USING clause
 - polwithcheck: WITH CHECK clause

How do I use RLS?

ALTER TABLE customers ENABLE ROW LEVEL SECURITY;

• Remember: deny by default



How do l use RLS?
CREATE POLICY custpolicy
ON customer
FOR ALL
TO public
USING customer_user = CURRENT_USER;

How do I use RLS? SELECT * FROM customer; SELECT * FROM customer (WHERE customer_user = CURRENT_USER);

Okay, but what about your clickbait title?

It does suck

- And RLS sucks too
- Why?

What's wrong with how RLS works?

- It assumes that your application works a certain way
- People generally don't have data separated by database user that accesses it
- You don't want Postgres to manage your application users
 - Roles system has global scope
 - Can't store user attributes/preferences

What's wrong with how RLS works?

- Your application connects to DB using a single user
 - Makes auditing difficult
 - Changing this would require a significant rewrite
- Aligning application users and DB roles is tedious
 - Spaghetti of GRANTs
 - You have to keep them in sync too



What can we do?

A possible solution

- SET variables and use those in the POLICY
 CREATE POLICY transpolicy
 ON transaction FOR ALL TO public
 USING
 (tenant = current_setting('app.tenant'));
 - **SET** app.tenant = 'Megacorp';

A possible solution

Feeling paranoid?
 CREATE POLICY transpolicy
 ON transaction FOR ALL TO public
 USING (tenant =
 current_setting('app.tenant')::uuid);
 SET app.tenant =

'465f2480-bbca-4eb0-8dd5-c6310b724e37';

A possible solution

Depending on whether you use connection pooling:
 SET LOCAL app.tenant =

 '465f2480-bbca-4eb0-8dd5-c6310b724e37';



Want to take this a step further?



- Explicit Access Control List and Role-Based Access Control
- Add an ACL column to the table:
 ALTER TABLE transaction
 ADD acl uuid[] NOT NULL DEFAULT '{}'::uuid[]
- ARRAY of uuid (if we use UUIDs for role identifiers)

- SET the roles that are granted access in the ACL
 - SET app.tenant_roles =
 '{dda71d2d-67d8-4f00-b877-41ab442e62ea,
 039746dc-48a1-4e2a-b765-968f689ac84f}';

What does the RLS policy look like?
 CREATE POLICY transrolepolicy
 ON transaction FOR ALL TO public
 USING (acl &&
 current_setting('app.tenant_roles')::uuid[]
 = true);
 ALTER TABLE transaction

ENABLE ROW LEVEL SECURITY;

- The policy checks if any of the tenant roles are inside the ACL
- RBAC
 - Roles can have attributes that define their privileges
 - Like Postgres roles, can be thought of as "groups" (of one or more tenants)
 - Can be granted to other roles, and then you have an aggregate of the privileges
 - Yes, we parallel the PostgreSQL roles system 😂 😭



Want to dive even deeper?



How would you protect from application?

- After all, the application can connect to the DB and change roles and policies
- You hide direct access to this system from the application
- Why?

- You don't trust your / third party application

• Let's assume Django app

```
Database-side
 CREATE ROLE django;
 CREATE TABLE transaction (
   id uuid PRIMARY KEY DEFAULT
       gen_random_uuid(),
   amount numeric,
   created_at timestamptz DEFAULT CURRENT_TIME,
   acl uuid[] NOT NULL DEFAULT '{}'::uuid[]
```

- To speed up ACL enforcement, we need an index that supports ARRAY operations on it:
 CREATE INDEX ON transaction
 - **USING GIN** (acl array_ops);

```
CREATE TABLE tenant_role (
  role_id uuid PRIMARY KEY,
  role_name text NOT NULL UNIQUE,
  role_description text
CREATE TABLE tenant_role_member (
  tenant_id uuid REFERENCES tenant(tenant_id),
  role_id uuid REFERENCES tenant_role(role_id);
```

CREATE INDEX ON tenant_role_member(tenant_id);

 Remove the ability of DB user django to see inner workings: REVOKE ALL ON tenant_role FROM django; REVOKE ALL ON tenant_role_member FROM django; REVOKE SELECT ON transaction FROM django; GRANT SELECT (id, amount, created_at) ON transaction TO django;

• Create the policy:

CREATE POLICY trans_rls ON transaction
USING (acl &&
current_setting('app.tenant_roles')::uuid[]
= true);

ALTER TABLE transaction ENABLE ROW LEVEL SECURITY;

Expose RBAC to Django through functions

- create_tenant_role(_role_name text, _role_description text) RETURNS uuid enables creation of tenant roles
- get_tenant_roles(_tenant_id uuid) RETURNS uuid[] returns the roles that have been assigned to a tenant
- set_tenant_roles(_tenant_id uuid, _roles uuid[]) RETURNS boolean sets all roles for a tenant

One more thing...

- For each table, we need an "add role to row acl" function and a "remove role from row acl function"
- These can be called e.g. by overriding Django's .save()
- Important when using SECURITY DEFINER: SET search_path = public, pg_temp; (at the bottom of each function definition)

Finally, a few potential RLS catches

- Policies can add overhead to queries
 - Especially complex conditions
 - Keep policies simple and explicit
- Superuser can bypass all RLS checks
- Table owner can bypass RLS check if FORCE ROW LEVEL SECURITY is not specified

Finally, a few potential RLS catches

- Set a restrictive **DELETE** policy
 - So that people can't delete rows they can read but not update
- Make sure you reset variables between sessions
 - PgBouncer statement mode won't work with SET/SET LOCAL
- Ensure **WITH (SECURITY BARRIER)** is in place for views
 - To stop malicious function overrides with cost
 0.000000000001 etc.

FOSDEM Brussels, 2025-02-02

Thank you 🧡

35% off! Code: **au35ang**



29% off at amazon.com, 21% off at amazon.com.be



